

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

ELSI JOSSELINE FLORES
VILLATORO,

Plaintiff,

v.

CATERPILLAR LOGISTICS INC.

Defendant.

Case No. 1:23-cv-01463-JLT-CDB

SCHEDULING ORDER (Fed. R. Civ. P. 16)

Rule 26 Disclosures: March 15, 2024

Pleading Amendment: June 11, 2024

Discovery Deadlines:

Non-Expert: October 8, 2024

Expert: February 6, 2025

Mid-Discovery Status Conf.: August 27, 2024

Non-Dispositive Motion Deadlines:

Filing: October 8, 2024

Hearing: November 19, 2024, 10:30 a.m.

Dispositive Motion Deadlines:

Filing: January 20, 2025

Hearing: February 25, 2025, 8:30 a.m.

Pre-Trial Conference: April 21, 2025, 1:30 p.m.

2500 Tulare Street, Fresno, CA

Trial: June 17, 2025, 8:30 a.m.

2500 Tulare Street, Fresno, CA

3-5 day trial

On October 12, 2023, Defendant Caterpillar Logistics Inc., removed this action from state court. (Doc.1). In her complaint Plaintiff Elsi Josseline Flores Villatoro raises claims against Defendant for (1) Constructive Wrongful Termination in violation of Cal. Govt Code §12940, the Fair

1 Employment and Housing Act (“FEHA”); (2) Harassment in violation of FEHA, Cal. Govt. Code §
2 12970(j); (3) Retaliation in violation of FEHA Cal. Gov. Code §12940(h); and (4) Intentional
3 Infliction of Emotional Distress. The Court convened with the parties via Zoom for a scheduling
4 conference on March 11, 2024. Maribel Ullrich appeared on behalf of Plaintiff; Jennifer Gentin
5 appeared on behalf of Defendant.

6 **I. Magistrate Judge Consent**

7 Currently there is no joint consent to Magistrate Judge jurisdiction.

8 **Notice of Congested Docket and Court Policy of Trailing**

9 Due to the District Judges’ heavy caseload, the adopted policy of the Fresno Division of the
10 Eastern District is to trail all civil cases. The parties are hereby notified that for a trial date set before a
11 District Judge, the parties will trail indefinitely behind any higher priority criminal or older civil case
12 set on the same date until a courtroom becomes available. The trial date will not be reset.

13 The Magistrate Judges’ availability is far more realistic and accommodating to parties than that
14 of the District Judges who carry the heaviest caseloads in the nation and who must prioritize criminal
15 and older civil cases over more recently filed civil cases. A Magistrate Judge may conduct trials,
16 including entry of final judgment, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 636(c), Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 73,
17 and Local Rule 305. Any appeal from a judgment entered by a Magistrate Judge is taken directly to
18 the United States Court of Appeal for the Ninth Circuit.

19 Therefore, the parties are directed to consider consenting to Magistrate Judge jurisdiction to
20 conduct all further proceedings, including trial, and to file a consent/decline form (provided by the
21 Court at the inception of this case) indicating whether they will consent to the jurisdiction of the
22 Magistrate Judge.

23 **II. Pleading Amendment**

24 Any motions to amend the pleadings, including to add parties and/or allegations and claims,
25 must be filed by **June 11, 2024**. Filing a motion and/or stipulation requesting leave to amend the
26 pleadings does not reflect on the propriety of the amendment or imply good cause to modify the
27 existing schedule, if necessary. All proposed amendments must (A) be supported by good cause
28 pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 16(b) if the amendment requires any modification to the existing schedule,

1 *see Johnson v. Mammoth Recreations, Inc.*, 975 F.2d 604, 609 (9th Cir. 1992), and (B) establish,
2 under Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a), that such an amendment is not (1) prejudicial to the opposing party, (2)
3 the product of undue delay, (3) proposed in bad faith, or (4) futile, *see Foman v. Davis*, 371 U.S. 178,
4 182 (1962).

5 **III. Discovery Plan and Cut-Off Date**

6 The parties shall exchange the initial disclosures required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a)(1) by no
7 later than **March 15, 2024**.

8 The parties are ordered to complete all discovery pertaining to non-experts on or before
9 **October 8, 2024**, and all discovery pertaining to experts on or before **February 6, 2025**.

10 The parties are directed to disclose all expert witnesses¹, in writing, on or before **December 22,**
11 **2024**, and to disclose all rebuttal experts on or before **January 20, 2025**. The written designation of
12 retained and non-retained experts shall be made pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. Rule 26(a)(2), (A), (B),
13 and (C) and shall include all information required thereunder. Failure to designate experts in
14 compliance with this order may result in the Court excluding the testimony or other evidence offered
15 through such experts that are not disclosed pursuant to this order.

16 The provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(4) and (5) shall apply to all discovery relating to
17 experts and their opinions. Experts must be fully prepared to be examined on all subjects and opinions
18 included in the designation. Failure to comply will result in the imposition of sanctions, which may
19 include striking the expert designation and preclusion of expert testimony.

20 The provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(e) regarding a party's duty to timely supplement
21 disclosures and responses to discovery requests will be strictly enforced.

22 A mid-discovery status conference is scheduled for **August 27, 2024**, at 9:30 a.m. before Judge
23 Baker. Counsel SHALL file a joint mid-discovery status conference report no later than one week
24 before the conference. Counsel also SHALL lodge the joint status report via e-mail to
25 CDBorders@caed.uscourts.gov. The joint status report SHALL outline the discovery counsel have
26

27 ¹ In the event an expert will offer opinions related to an independent medical or mental health
28 evaluation, the examination SHALL occur sufficiently in advance of the disclosure deadline so the expert's
report fully details the expert's opinions in this regard.

completed and that which needs to be completed as well as any impediments to completing the discovery within the deadlines set forth in this order. Counsel SHALL discuss settlement and certify in the joint status report (1) that they have met/conferred regarding settlement, and (2) proposed dates for convening a settlement conference before a U.S. Magistrate Judge.

IV. Pre-Trial Motion Schedule / Informal Discovery Dispute Conferences

All non-dispositive pre-trial motions, including any discovery motions, shall be filed no later than **October 8, 2024**,² and heard on **November 19, 2024**. The Court hears non-dispositive motions at 10:30 a.m. at the United States District Courthouse in Bakersfield, California before Judge Baker.

No motion to amend or stipulation to amend the case schedule will be entertained unless it is filed at least one week before the first deadline the parties wish to extend. Likewise, no written discovery motions shall be filed without the prior approval of the Court. A party with a discovery dispute must first confer with the opposing party in a good faith effort to resolve by agreement the issues in dispute. If that good faith effort is unsuccessful, the moving party promptly shall seek a hearing with all involved parties and Judge Baker. For these hearings and at the direction of the Courtroom Deputy Clerk, the Court may direct counsel to appear remotely (via Zoom). For hearings noticed to occur in-person, the Court may permit counsel to appear remotely (via Zoom) provided the Courtroom Deputy Clerk receives a written notice of the request to appear remotely no later than five court days before the noticed hearing date.

At least three days before the conference, counsel SHALL file informal letter briefs detailing their positions. The briefs may not exceed 5 pages, excluding exhibits. Counsel must comply with Local Rule 251 with respect to discovery disputes.

All dispositive pre-trial motions shall be filed no later than **January 20, 2025**, and heard on **February 25, 2025, at 8:30 a.m.** In scheduling such motions, absent consent to Magistrate Judge jurisdiction, counsel SHALL consult the assigned District Judge's general information and calendar accordingly and SHALL comply with Fed. R. Civ. P. 56 and Local Rules 230 and 260.

² Non-dispositive motions related to non-expert discovery SHALL be filed within a reasonable time of discovery of the dispute, but in no event later than 10 days after the expiration of the non-expert discovery deadline.

1 **V. Motions for Summary Judgment or Summary Adjudication**

2 At least 21 days before filing a motion for summary judgment or motion for summary
3 adjudication, the parties SHALL meet, in person or by telephone, to confer about the issues to be
4 raised in the motion.

5 The purpose of the meeting shall be to: 1) avoid filing motions for summary judgment where a
6 question of fact exists; 2) determine whether the respondent agrees that the motion has merit in whole
7 or in part; 3) discuss whether issues can be resolved without the necessity of briefing; 4) narrow the
8 issues for review by the court; 5) explore the possibility of settlement before the parties incur the
9 expense of briefing a motion; and 6) to develop a joint statement of undisputed facts.

10 The moving party SHALL initiate the meeting and SHALL provide a complete, proposed
11 statement of undisputed facts **at least five days before** the conference. The finalized joint statement
12 of undisputed facts SHALL include all facts that the parties agree, for purposes of the motion, may be
13 deemed true. In addition to the requirements of Local Rule 260, the moving party shall file the joint
14 statement of undisputed facts.

15 In the notice of motion, the moving party SHALL certify that the parties have met and
16 conferred as ordered above, or set forth a statement of good cause for the failure to meet and confer.
17 Failure to comply may result in the motion being stricken.

18 **VI. Pre-Trial Conference**

19 **April 21, 2025**, at 1:30 p.m., located at the United States District Courthouse, 2500 Tulare
20 Street, in Fresno, California, before District Judge Jennifer L. Thurston.

21 The parties are ordered to file a Joint Pretrial Statement pursuant to Local Rule 281(a)(2). The
22 parties are further directed to submit a digital copy of their pretrial statement in Word format, directly
23 to District Judge Thurston's chambers, by email at JLTorders@caed.uscourts.gov.

24 Counsels' attention is directed to Rules 281 and 282 of the Local Rules for the Eastern District
25 of California, as to the obligations of counsel in preparing for the pre-trial conference. The Court will
26 insist upon strict compliance with those rules. In addition to the matters set forth in the Local Rules,
27 the Joint Pretrial Statement shall include a Joint Statement of the case to be used by the Court to
28 explain the nature of the case to the jury during voir dire.

1 **VII. Trial Date**

2 **June 17, 2025**, at 8:30 a.m., located at the United States District Courthouse, 2500 Tulare
3 Street, in Fresno, California, before District Judge Jennifer L. Thurston.

4 A. This is a jury trial.

5 B. Counsels' Estimate of Trial Time: 3-5 days

6 C. Counsels' attention is directed to Local Rules of Practice for the Eastern District of
7 California, Rule 285.

8 **VIII. Settlement Conference**

9 The parties SHALL meet and confer and notify the Court prior to the Pre-Trial Conference
10 whether they wish to convene a Settlement Conference. In the event the parties request a Settlement
11 Conference, unless otherwise permitted in advance by the Court, the attorneys who will try the case
12 shall appear at the settlement conference with the parties and the person or persons having full
13 authority to negotiate and settle the case on any terms³ at the conference.

14 Consideration of settlement is a serious matter that requires preparation prior to the settlement
15 conference. Set forth below are the procedures the Court will employ, absent good cause, in
16 conducting the conference.

17 At least twenty-one days before the settlement conference, Plaintiff SHALL submit to
18 Defendant via fax or e-mail, a written itemization of damages and a meaningful⁴ settlement demand
19 which includes a brief explanation of why such a settlement is appropriate. Thereafter, no later than
20 fourteen days before the settlement conference, Defendant SHALL respond, via fax or e-mail, with an
21

22 ³ Insurance carriers, business organizations, and governmental bodies or agencies whose
23 settlement agreements are subject to approval by legislative bodies, executive committees, boards of
24 directors or the like shall be represented by a person or persons who occupy high executive positions in
25 the party organization and who will be directly involved in the process of approval of any settlement
offers or agreements. To the extent possible, the representative shall have authority, if he or she deems
it appropriate, to settle the action on terms consistent with the opposing party's most recent demand.

26 ⁴ "Meaningful" means the offer is reasonably calculated to settle the case on terms acceptable to
27 the offering party. "Meaningful" does not include an offer which the offering party knows will not be
28 acceptable to the other party. If, however, the offering party is only willing to offer a settlement which
it knows the other party will not accept, this should trigger a recognition the case is not in a settlement
posture and the parties should confer about continuing or vacating the settlement conference via
stipulation.

1 acceptance of the offer or with a meaningful counteroffer which includes a brief explanation of why
2 such a settlement is appropriate.

3 If settlement is not achieved, each party SHALL attach copies of their settlement offers to their
4 Confidential Settlement Conference Statement, as described below. Copies of these documents shall
5 not be filed on the court docket.

6 **CONFIDENTIAL SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE STATEMENT**

7 At least five court days prior to the settlement conference, the parties shall submit, directly to
8 Judge Baker's chambers by e-mail to CDBOrders@caed.uscourts.gov, a Confidential Settlement
9 Conference Statement. The statement should not be filed with the Clerk of the Court nor served on
10 any other party, although the parties may file a Notice of Lodging of Settlement Conference
11 Statement. Each statement shall be clearly marked "confidential" with the date and time of the
12 settlement conference indicated prominently thereon.

13 The Confidential Settlement Conference Statement shall include the following:

- 14 A. A brief statement of the facts of the case.
- 15 B. A brief statement of the claims and defenses, i.e., statutory or other grounds upon
16 which the claims are founded; a forthright evaluation of the parties' likelihood of prevailing on the
17 claims and defenses; and a description of the major issues in dispute.
- 18 C. A summary of the proceedings to date.
- 19 D. An estimate of the cost and time to be expended for further discovery, pretrial and trial.
- 20 E. The relief sought.
- 21 F. The party's position on settlement, including present demands and offers and a history
22 of past settlement discussions, offers and demands.

23 **IX. Request for Bifurcation, Appointment of Special Master, or other Techniques to Shorten**
24 **Trial**

25 None at this time.

26 **X. Related Matters Pending**

27 There are no pending related matters.

28

XI. Compliance with Federal Procedure

All counsel are expected to familiarize themselves with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the Local Rules of the Eastern District of California, and to keep abreast of any amendments thereto. The Court requires compliance with these Rules to efficiently handle its increasing case load.

XII. Effect of this Order

The foregoing order represents the best estimate of the court and counsel as to the agenda most suitable to dispose of this case. The trial date reserved is specifically reserved for this case. If the parties determine at any time that the schedule outlined in this order cannot be met, counsel are ordered to notify the court immediately of that fact so that adjustments may be made, either by stipulation or by subsequent status conference.

The dates set in this Order are considered to be firm and will not be modified absent a showing of good cause even if the request to modify is made by stipulation. Stipulations extending the deadlines contained herein will not be considered unless they are accompanied by affidavits or declarations, and where appropriate attached exhibits, which establish good cause for granting the relief requested.

Failure to comply with this order may result in the imposition of sanctions.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: March 11, 2024


UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE